

ML

RECEIVED
FEB 20 1981

410061

W. J. BAIR

- W. W. Burr, EV-3
- H. Hollister, EV-4
- C. W. Edington, EV-30
- H. McCammon, EV-32
- J. Thiessen, EV-34
- J. Blair, EV-34
- T. McCraw, EV-30
- J. Deal, EV-131

- W. J. Bair, PNL ←
- V. Bond, BNL
- V. Noshkin, LLNL
- W. Robison, LLNL
- C. Unruh, PNL

FYI



United States Department of the Interior

OFFICE OF THE SECRETARY
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20240

FFR 11 1981

Dr. Bruce Wachholz
Office of Health and
Environmental Research
Office of Environment
Department of Energy
Mail Station E-201
Washington, D.C. 20545

Dear Dr. Wachholz:

Enclosed for your information is a set of ~~the~~ Summary Notes of the December 10, 1980, meeting on the Marshall Islands Health Plan.

You will recall that at the start of the meeting I indicated that there would not be any official minutes and that participants should keep their own record. ~~We~~ produced these summary notes for our own working purposes and I am sharing them with the other interested agencies. The Notes are not in polished form nor do they attempt to be a verbatim record but you may find them useful for the record.

Sincerely,

Mrs. Ruth G. Van Cleve
Deputy Assistant Secretary - Policy
Territorial and International Affairs

Enclosure

carry out the education and information program through training courses both in the Marshalls and the United States. Pretaped radio programs, presented in both Marshallese and English,

would provide broadcast information about nuclear radiation and its possible effects. There would be systematic evaluation of the effectiveness of the communication process and modifications of the program as necessary. The program would be a continuing one, to reinforce, review and update the information.

The estimated cost of the Education and Information Program for the first full year would be \$950,000. Details of the plan and continuing costs were outlined in the official document, "Marshall Islands Radiation Education and Information Program Plan" that was distributed to all participants.

Discussion on Radiation Education and Information Proposal

Mr. Ron Cogswell, TIA, Interior OMB Examiner, asked whether continuing program costs were included. These continuing costs are outlined on pages 23 and 45 of the Education and Information Document. First year costs would be \$950,000, 2nd year costs would be \$840,000 then dropping to \$410,000 for the fifth year. Starting with the 9th year the costs would jump again to \$970,000 largely due to the starting again of training teams in the United States and development of special programs.

Ms. Elaine Falender, (Covington & Burling, Legal Advisors for the Government of the Marshalls) inquired what the costs would be if the education and information programs were to be extended beyond the four named atolls. Dr. Unrah noted that expansion of the program to cover all of the Marshalls would probably mean a cost that would be approximately 3 times as high, i.e., first year costs in the range of \$2.3 million. Ms. Falender wondered why the cost should go that high since so many of the items appeared to be fixed costs. Assistant Secretary Clusen stated that additional information on costs for a program to cover all of the Marshalls would be provided later.

Mr. Richard F. Gerry (Marshalls Islands Atomic Testing Litigation Project) inquired whether a determination had been made as to what were the "other affected atolls". (Note: The MIALP represents the people of Rongelap, Utirik, groups and individuals of various other islands and atolls in the Northern Marshalls.

Mrs. Van Cleve, TIA, noted that the contractor was not asked to define "an affected atoll" and that the question would be addressed later at a more appropriate time. It was not the contractor's responsibility.

Dr. Unrah stated that it was anticipated that the program would cover all aspects of radiation problems and that the local magistrates or island councils would assist in selecting the trainees working with the designated contractor.

Mr. Richard Gerry of MIATLP asked whether DOE would be in charge of implementing the proposal. Assistant Secretary Ruth Clusen pointed out that under the current law, P.L. 96-205, the Department of Interior is in charge of the implementation.

Mr. J. Weisgall, Legal Advisor for the people of Bikini, asked whether the two booklets prepared for the Enewetak and Bikini Dose and Risk Assessment meetings had been reviewed with the respective groups of people, i.e., Enewetakese and Bikinians as their usefulness. Dr. Unrah stated that this had not been done as yet but certainly would be part of any evaluation program. Mr. Weisgall stated that in his opinion it would

Mrs. Van Cleve, TIA, stated that eventually the three proposals would be integrated but that there had not been time to do prior to the December 10 meeting.

Mr. Gerry, MIATLP, queried as to whether there would be training provided to residents and provision of "education and information" programs to residents who have moved away from their home atolls.

Mr. T. Mitchell, MLSC, stated that education of the Marshall Islands Government and its officials on radiation effects is equally important. He cited an endless stream of horror stories that emanate from the Government of the Marshalls with respect to radiation effects in the Marshalls as a result of the testing program.

Former Secretary Anton DeBrum thanked Mr. Mitchell for his belief that the Government of Marshalls officials are capable of being educated. He had no other comments on Mr. Mitchell's assertion of horror stories emanating from the Government of the Marshalls. Mr. DeBrum criticized DOE and its Education and Information contractor for not consulting initially with designated MIG officials. The DOE and Contractor team visit had come at a time when certain key MIG officials were at the Kona Status talks. MIG had requested a postponement of visit until the key officials were back in the Marshalls but DOE and contract team had ignored that request and had gone ahead and met with other MIG officials.

Mr. Debrum also stated that the presentation again provided a sense of deju vu. The Northern Marshalls Radiological Survey results were still awaited. Two years had gone by and Doe still had not released the results. He pointed out that the Government of the Marshalls does not believe that radiation effects are restricted to the four named atolls. MIG believes that radiation is elsewhere in the Marshalls. The government cannot understand why DOE keeps stalling with respect to releasing results of the Northern Marshalls Raidological Survey.

With respect to one aspect of the Education and Information Plan, he noted that the College of Micronesia was slated to play an essential role. He wished to state that, to date, the Government of the Marshalls has not taken a firm position on the role of the College of Micronesia in the Marshalls and therefore, he could not say that this aspect would be supported or could be followed.

He commented on the difficulties of transportation in an area as widespread as the Marshalls and noted that the Government of the Marshalls has tried to give Bikini and Enewetak transportation requests priority.

Including some of the people of Eniwetok.

Dr. Noshkin, then, explained that the plan as presented was built around the four named atolls.

Mr. Jefferson, MIALP, asked whether DOE would run the monitoring program. Dr. Noshkin stated that the law gave DOI the implementation responsibility. He could not comment on what DOI might do in the future to carry out this aspect.

Mr. Jefferson, MIALP, commented that his group had strong feelings about possible contractors for any future monitoring work and would like to have a later opportunity to state them.

Mrs. Van Cleve, TIA, indicated that DOI is prepared to receive comments on this aspect.

Mr. Jonathan Weisgall, Legal Advisor for the people of Bikini, asked whether written comments presented by the various groups to DOI could be shared by all.

Mr. Gerry, MIALP, said that his group would be willing to provide copies of comments to any group present.

Mrs. Van Cleve, TIA, commented that if the originator could do this that would be fine and would they indicate distribution on the original sent to DOI. DOI, though, would be prepared to provide copies if needed.

Mr. T. Mitchell, Enewetak Counsel, asked whether any Federal Agency comments would also be circulated. Mrs. Van Cleve stated that if any agency comments were received within the week, they could be made available.

Mr. T. Mitchell, Enewetak, stated that he liked the Environmental Plan. He believes it goes the full distance, it covers the four named atolls, and provides for future research. He had two observations. The first involved the development of standards for Dose Assessment comparison. How are the standards going to be developed? If question of standards are to be part of the plan and would be developed by contractor, then Mitchell would want to be involved.

Dr. Noshkin commented that the reference to standards in the proposal was meant to refer to acceptable U.S. Federal standards. Mr. Mitchell, then stressed that he sees a need for the involvement of the local people (the four atolls) in the monitoring program. The research, the visits, the sampling, etc., should be explained carefully. Dr. Noshkin agreed that this was an important aspect and anticipated that prior to the start of every monitoring visit, a preliminary briefing session would be held with the local people.

Mr. Mitchell, Enewetak, raised the question of transportation and communication support for the monitoring program. How would this be handled?

Dr. Noshkin pointed out that a special vessel would be needed. The current DOE program has a chartered vessel.

Mr. Mitchell asked if there were a dedicated vessel, would there be any unused times available?

Dr. Noshkin commented that the new program would call for 5 months use. Possibly the Education program might use 2 months. This could leave up to 5 months free, but this was a guess at this stage.

Dr. Bruce Wachholz of DOE stated that it was premature to try to predict vessel use for various components at this time. Actual needs of each aspects are not really known now.

Mr. Gerry, MIALP, asked when would the reports mentioned be available from LLL? Also could raw data be made available to MIALP? Dr. Noshkin indicated that some reports would be forthcoming within the next 5-6 months.

Mr. Gerry asked again about raw data. Dr. Noshkin indicated that he believes the raw data without analysis would not be very useful.

Mr. R. Cogswell, OMB, referred to page 51 and asked for clarification of the two sets of figures. This was explained as being due to the possibility of a new contractor coming in and then mobilization costs, etc., would rise sharply.

Secretary for Foreign Affairs Anton Debrum also asked when reports on the Northern Marshalls Radiological Survey would be made available. He also queried about the availability of raw material. Dr. Noshkin again explained that it was his opinion that the raw data would not be very meaningful. Mr. DeBrum stated that the Government of the Marshall Islands would like to have a chance to assess the raw data but DOE and LLL keep evading this matter.

Dr. Noshkin explained the many thousands of analyses that had to be carried out on the samples. He reiterated that the analysis is very difficult, complicated and very time consuming.

Assistant Secretary Clusen, at this point, noted that DOE and LLL, at the request of the Congressional committees, had given priority to the "Bikini Atoll data" and this portion had been done.

Mr. Gerry, MIALP, stressed that his group had clients living on Rongelap and Utirik who were asking their legal advisors whether they should continue to live on these atolls that had received radiation fallout. Possibly, clients' lives might be in danger. It was essential that MIALP had access to original survey material and have it analyzed by its own experts and to have the final LLL reports in order to have them appraised also.

Presentation of Loma Linda Health Proposal

Dr. Richard Hart, Chairman, School of Public Health, Loma Linda University, presented an outline of the proposal prepared under contract to DOI. He discussed each issue presented on page 106-108 relating to the Four Atoll proposal and then discussed the items in the Executive Summary on page 4. He also outlined the reason why provisions for improvement of primary and secondary care all over the Marshalls was set forth in the alternate plan. All participants had been supplied copies of the Loma Linda

services that could not be met by using air service.

Mr. Cogswell, OMB, referred to P.L. 96-205 and asked what is the responsibility of the Government of the Marshall Islands for providing basic health care to its citizens. It was noted that the budget proposals for the four atoll proposal, as well as a health care proposal for all of the Marshalls, included a first year contribution of \$3.5 million from Marshall Islands Government funding, and MIG funds also would be available in continuing years. In answer to a question on cost escalation, Dr. Hart explained that an approximate 20% inflationary factor had been built into the proposal after year one, i.e., 1980. Also population growth had been taken into account.

Mr. Gerry, MIALP, stated the proposal was a fine health plan but he denied the fact that radiation problems are not "minimal" as stated in the proposal. In fact, he believes they are "great" in the Marshalls. Up and beyond the actual radiation aspects, there are mental health effects that also are very significant. Special health care for all aspects of radiation related aspects should be provided to the "affected peoples" by the United States Government.

He commented that in his estimation, the plan by denying or downgrading the radiation factors has made it politically impossible for the U.S. Congress to accept it. Congress scarcely would underwrite health care for all the people of the Marshalls unless it were shown that the underlying cause was care needed because of results of the U.S. atomic testing program.

Additionally, the report was contradictory on the "radiation aspects". The overall plan stressed "minimal effects of radiation" yet the report in places also stressed the "thyroid abnormalities" of the Rongelapese and Utirikese and other related radiation effects on the exposed people". He also found the statistics cited unexplained. Table 4 on page 27 showed cancer to be the leading cause of death in the Marshalls. Would you not expect in an "undeveloped area" to have other causes more important? Was it not possible that radiation exposure might be reflected in the cancer statistics? Had any studies been done on children? What about the documented reports of birth abnormalities, etc.? Why were these aspects ignored?

care for the people of the four named atolls with secondary and tertiary treatment outside the Marshalls? The Department of

The INTERPOL could never make up his mind with respect to P.L. 96-205 but he had hoped that the contractor would have made a better interpretation and produced a plan for health care for the people of the four named atolls.

but not providing special primary care if former residents or kin have settled, by their own volition, in places such as Majuro, Ebeye, Ailuk, etc., or other parts of the Marshalls. While this would provide differing types of health care on various islands and to special groups, costs might not be as great as set forth in the Loma Linda Four Atoll proposal.

Mr. Mitchell (Enewetak) reiterated that he would like to see a budget based specifically on special care for the people of the four atolls only. He objected to the figure of \$7-\$8 Million in the Four Atoll Plan to upgrade the hospitals at Ebeye and Majuro. The "affected peoples" should be provided secondary and tertiary care at Kwajalein or in Honolulu not in hospitals operated by the Marshall Islands Government.

Mr. Gerry (MIATLP) took issue with Mr. Mitchell. He pointed out that the statute "refers to the people of the affected atolls and people of the four named atolls. Many of these people now are scattered throughout the Marshalls and by the statute they are entitled to special care. He referred again to the lack of reports on the Northern Marshalls Radiological Survey

locations but not to provide "special primary care" for representatives of the affected peoples all over the Marshalls. In brief, there would be designated areas where this special care would be available to the "affected people". He also urged the Federal agencies concerned to address the pending problem of "other affected atolls" in any preliminary report to Congress. This aspect must be addressed since any special health care program designed for the peoples of the four atolls might later have to be expanded to "other affected atolls".

Ms. Falender (Rep., Government of Marshall Islands) would like to see in advance any report that would be sent to Congress. Is this feasible?

obviously would be preliminary in nature. She noted also that

PARTICIPANTS

DECEMBER 10, 1980, MEETING ON THE PROPOSED MARSHALLS HEALTH PLAN

NAME	AGENCY	PHONE No.
John M. [unclear]	MLSC	
Hester [unclear]	MLSC	
Marac [unclear]	MLSC	
W.A. Bender	MLSC	
Joe Blais	DOE	353-3269
R.S. FOWLER	DNA	325 7132
RUTH VAN CLEVE	DOI - TIA	343-4822
JOHN DE YOUNG	DOI - TIA	343-6816
GEORGE MILNER	DOI - TIA	343-6816
CHECK DOWNS	DOI - TIA	
W.W. Sun	DOE	253-3153
Victor ENOSHKIN	DOE-LLL	
W. J. BAIR	DOE - PNL	509-375-2421
Henry Gill	DOE	252-8700
JOSEPH Di Stefano	"	" "
Steve Gottlieb	"	252-6947
Bruce Wachholtz	"	
Billy Paul	DOF	343-6346
Georg [unclear]	DOE-PNL	
RICHARD W. FEARKE	OMSN	343-9143
Marshall [unclear]	C.I.	

✓ JACK HEKENA
✓ REPORT EMMIUS
✓ *[unclear]*
[unclear]
✓ *[unclear]*
✓ *[unclear]*
✓ *[unclear]*

MAJURO, MARSHALL GOVT
MAJURO MARSHALL GOVT
T.P.P.I.
[unclear]
[unclear]
Ginsburg *[unclear]*

REPOSITORY PNNL
COLLECTION Marshall Islands
BOX No. 5688
FOLDER Marshall Islands Jan - May 1981

DOCUMENT DOES NOT CONTAIN ECI

Reviewed by LJ Kusner Date 4/30/97