

Reviewed by J. H. Schultz Date 4/30/97

TRUST TERRITORY OF THE PACIFIC ISLANDS

Office of the High Commissioner, Saipan

REPOSITORY

PNNL

COLLECTION

Marshall Islands

TO : High Commissioner

DATE: 29 October 1980

BOX No.

5684

FROM : TTPI LNO Kwajalein

FOLDER

B Untitled

409881

SUBJECT: Kili Dose Assessment Trip - October 5-9
(Majuro/Saipan dates used throughout this memo)

Background -- While on Saipan in early September I was requested by the High Commissioner to accompany the U.S. delegation on its dose assessment trip to Kili in early October. That trip resulted from a request by Bikinians, who had attended the Ujelang Dose Assessment Conference in September of 1979, for a similar presentation covering Bikini Atoll. The following individuals comprised the U.S. delegation:

- Hal Hollister-DOE
- Bruce Wachholz-DOE
- Tommy McCraw-DOE
- Steve Gottlieb-DOE legal counsel
- Roger Ray-DOE
- Bill Robison-Lawrence Livermore Laboratory
- Dr. Bill Bair-Pacific Northwest Laboratory
- Reynold deBrum-DOE Majuro representative
- Gordon Law-DOE
- Gary Boehlke-DOE legal counsel (NEPA)
- Alice Buck-DOE (translator)

Also accompanying the delegation were Marshall Islands Government Chief Secretary Oscar deBrum and aid to the MIG Foreign Affairs Secretary, Edinal Jorkan. Judy Knappe, at the request of Ted Mitchell, and Jeff Jefferson of the Marshall Islands Atomic Litigation Project as Henchi Balos' special observer, also accompanied the group.

Cost of Transportation -- The Marshall Islands Government assigned the Micro Palm as the charter vessel for the trip to Kili. The ship was in exceptionally clean condition, had just been repainted and was commanded by the redoubtable Captain Moses, in the opinion of most, the finest sea captain working in the Marshalls. The only mechanical problem experienced was with the outboard motor on the Palm's small boat which malfunctioned as we arrived at Kili, requiring the captain to borrow a 25 horsepower motor from a Kilian, "Captain Samuel". The borrowed motor fell off the Palm's small boat during landing efforts our first day at Kili. Having had his motor fully immersed, Captain Samuel asked Oscar deBrum for a replacement motor (the life of a motor is reputedly diminished by one-fourth following a dunking). Additionally, the three Bikinians who used the Palm's and their own boats to ferry people on and off Kili requested pay for their labor and \$50.00 per person was fixed upon. The Department of Energy will verify these costs, plus the cost of chartering the Micro Palm, to the High Commissioner

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

after the Marshall Islands Government sends its bill to DOE/PASO. The only other anticipated costs relating to Majuro/Kili/Kwajalein/Majuro transportation involve meals authorized for all Ejit passengers (there were twenty who finally went to Kili) plus about 100 Kilians who traveled Majuro/Kili and about fifty who traveled Kili/Majuro. I have requested DOE's Harry Brown to route through me at Kwajalein all trip costs which are being submitted to the High Commissioner for payment.

The Dose Assessment Conference -- Presentation of the booklet, "The Meaning of Radiation at Bikini Atoll", by Alice Buck in Marshallese and responses to the questions it generated formed the nucleus of the Dose Assessment Conference October 7 and 8 on Kili at the church. Gordon Law, however, fielded questions and offered statements which expanded the meetings beyond the factual presentation of the DOE/Lab group. In order to develop the most complete version of the two day sessions attended by from about 50 to 150 Bikinians, I have asked Jonathan Weisgall, Dr. Bill Bair, and Tommy McCraw to send me copies of their cassettes of the proceedings. What follows is a consolidation of Judy Knape's and my own handwritten notes. When and if cassettes are received I may develop a verbatim transcript if it would significantly improve on these summarized exchanges.

Opening remarks and the presentation began at 2:00 PM October 7. Questioning began after about ten pages of the booklet had been presented by Alice Buck in Marshallese, with slides.

Jibas, senior (alab): It's very sad to talk about land in the way described on page 10 of the booklet. The United States should just give me a million dollars. Why does Bikini Island have so much radiation when tests were performed elsewhere?

Bill Robison): Winds carried fallout to Bikini and, to a lesser extent, to Eneu. The winds were going east and a little south. The main part of the cloud hit Bikini Island, but an edge touched Eneu Island.

Jibas): Can people live on islands which are shown in light pink at page 11 in the book?

This will be answered later in the book; i.e., the amount of radiation which will be received in these islands would be below current Federal guidelines.

Would you (Robison) consider it safe for you and your family to live on Eneu?

(B. Robison): I would have no hesitation because of radiation considerations to live there as a family.

Statement: I wish the United States and its allies would remove the soil from (Bikinian) Bikini, but I see it goes down far, and would not like to see that.

Comment (Woman): Until the atoll has been cleaned, my family won't want to go back.

At this point, the presentation continued on until page 18 in the booklet before further questions were raised.

don't have that answer with us, but can get it and pass it to you through your legal counsel.

(Tomaki Juda): If people could go to Eneu, some of the people would request the Department of Energy to clean up Eneu so that the level of radiation would be even lower.

(J. Weisgall): Would a cleanup effectively reduce the exposure level?

(B. Robison): To reduce the dose, we would have to remove soil and particles all the way down so we would have to take a lot of soil. This might have serious effects on agriculture.

(Tomaki Juda): There is lots of soil there and if you took some, tree and plant roots would be closer to water.

(B. Robison): I don't know what the effect would be.

(Teacher): Is it 100 percent safe to live on Eneu?

(Dr. Bair): It's never 100 percent safe to live anywhere. On Eneu, even if you don't eat any food, you will inhale radioactive particles from the air and dust in very small amounts. It is an additional small risk.

(To B. Robison): You feel it would be safe for your family, but the book says there are diet restrictions and other restrictions. Do you still feel good about being there?

Law) decision you make, it will not detract from what Department of Interior is committed to do for all of the people of Bikini. The same facilities will be built here (Kili) as on Eneu and Ejit; however, participation by the Bikinians is necessary to ensure their promise for the future. Robert Kennedy quote: "The future is not a gift; it is an achievement."

Q: Explain why the Bikinians were allowed to return earlier; compare Bikini and Enewetak and tell us why Enewetak was cleaned up.

The answer is provided in the booklet; it was explained, and Alice Buck went through those answers on pages 30 and 31, pages which had not been covered the previous day, when time ran short.

Q(Johnny : Since three islands were destroyed (see map on page 9) does the Johnson) United States intend to pay for them?

A(Gordon Law): That answer is not for the Department of Interior, but I am certain your legal counsel will ensure your interests in this regard are protected and advanced. This is what we call in the States "passing the buck".

Comment(J. : I believe the people are entitled to compensation for the islands Weisgall) which were vaporized, for damage to other islands, for loss of crops, damage to people, and other damages. There are two approaches, one through the

gress, and the courts if necessary, this matter.

(Johnny : There appears to be a discrepancy between the graphs on page 5 and page
ohnson) 29 on the rate of decay of cesium.

(B. Robison) : Cesium in the ground (graph, page 5) decays at the rate of one-half its amount after 30 years. Cesium in the body is eliminated at the rate of one-third in 100 days. So the body eliminates cesium much faster than it decays on its own.

(Johnny : Do those Bikinians who left Bikini two years ago have any cesium in
Johnson) their bodies?

(B. Robison) : Their cesium level has dropped very quickly, and there is very little left.

Q: UT those who have cesium left in their bodies, is there any harm or danger in their bodies now? Is there sickness in their bodies now?

A(B. Robison) : There is no immediate sickness, but there is a small risk over a long period of time. There is no sickness in people we have seen, and the risk of harm is very small.

A(Dr. Bair) : The number of people in the Marshalls has increased three times in the last thirty years. We believe that the population will increase another three times in the next thirty years. If there were 550 Bikinians, there would be 1700 in thirty years. 1300 births would occur in the next thirty years, and about 160 deaths from all causes. One of the diseases causing death is cancer. 24 of the deaths will result from cancer. In Kili, you get about 20 millirems of natural radiation per year. In thirty years, that amounts to 600 millirems. Living on Kili would result in 0.06 to 0.2 more deaths caused by cancer. This figure needs to be included in the figure of 24 cancer-related deaths overall. If 500 persons lived in the United States and received United States background radiation over thirty years, there would be a 0.3 to 1.0 additional cancer deaths based on the United States average rate, which is much higher than Kili's.

If people had remained on Bikini, the radiation dose would have continued, and the risk of cancer would have increased. If people over thirty years receive 5000 millirems (and this is the U.S. Government standard) 0.5 to 2.0 additional cancer deaths could be expected. Even the radiation standard is not 100 percent safe, there is a risk. If an individual receives 15,000 millirems in thirty years, the risk increases by 1.4 to 7.0 additional cancer deaths. And if one were to receive 50,000 in thirty years, the risk would increase to 5.0 to 23 additional deaths from cancer. What this means is that while the standard per year is 500 millirems, the U.S. standard for thirty years total intake is 5000 millirems. For if a person were to receive 15,000 millirems over thirty years, the increased risk would be 1.4 to 7.0. Scientists feel it is not acceptable to receive 500 millirems every year, but that it is OK to receive 500 millirems some years.

The risk of cancer is less in a population that is exposed to a smaller amount of radiation than in a population exposed to higher amounts of radiation.

person were to receive 19,500 millirems per year, the risk would be 1.4 to 7.0. Scientists feel it is not acceptable to receive 500 millirems every year, but that it is OK to receive 500 millirems some years.

The risk of cancer is less in a population that is exposed to small amounts of radiation than in a population exposed to higher amounts of radiation.

If allowed to return to Bikini Atoll, what things could be done to help reduce dose intake?

Stay off of Bikini Island, and do not eat any local foods.

(Henchi Balos): Provide us the comparison of radiation dose at Kili and the dose at Eneu.

Net background exposure at Kili is 20-25 millirems per year, while at Eneu it would average 170 to a maximum of 390 millirems per year. This assumes imported foods are available and are combined with about one-half local food diet.

(Henchi Balos): Why is there such a difference between Kili and Eneu?

Fallout remains in the soil at Eneu, which is not present here at Kili.

If there is a small risk by living at Eneu and we are unable to deter our children from eating local foods and increasing their risk, will the United States take responsibility? If the diet is augmented and people depend primarily on imported food, will the United States Government be liable if children were to receive a larger dose because an acceptable standard still cannot be maintained?

(Hal Hollister): Under the "Burton Bill", responsibility to monitor the risk lies with the United States and we would hope that the people would take advantage of that bill, for it will provide health care and monitoring. The requirement for imported food is not perpetual. As the radiological level goes down via decay, eventually imported foods will no longer be required to stay within the guidelines.

(Henchi Balos): In 1978 DOE said Bikini Island would be off-limits for 60 to 100 years and Eneu would be off-limits for 20 to 30 years. Why are you not saying this now?

(Roger Ray): I don't remember any such statement by the United States.

Comment(J. : These were statements made in the U.S. Congressional testimony by
Weisgall) Department of Energy. Bruce Wachholz, you were there.

(Hal Hollister): We will follow up on this question and find out the information for you.

(Johnny : See paragraph 3 on page 28. Why was the mistake made which resulted
Johnson) in President Johnson approving the return of Bikinians to Bikini Atoll?
Was the information they had in error?

(B. Robison): Scientists in 1967 and 1968 had very little information and data. They didn't know much about radiation in the soil and plants and about dietary habits. Since that time we have monitored Bikini and Eneu and collected thousands of samples of food, soil, water, and fish. As a result we have much more information now than we did in 1968. With this additional information we can now estimate much more precisely the dose to be expected. We don't think these conclusions of today will change. However, we will continue to study and will pass on our findings and understandings to the Bikini people.

Johnny : Will you give us all reports from 1967 and 1968 up through the present?
(Inson)

(B. Robison): All reports are either published and available or are in the process of being made available.

statement(Jibas):(Having walked to the front of the church so that he was face to face with Gordon Law) I want to say to Law, I'm ready to return to Eneu. I want to go to Eneu with others of my family. I understand you will provide food.

(Gordon Law): If that is your decision this venerable gentleman will be returned and food will be provided; I will help you do it and help you with the restrictions.

statement(Jibas):(To the gathering of Bikinians) Those who wish to follow me raise your hands.

About five, mostly old people, raised their hands, according to Judy Knape's count. Scott Stege counted about ten, including Andrew Jakeo.

statement : We wish to meet further among ourselves and consider the information you (Young man) have given us.

(Gordon Law): There are fifty-six Bikini people here in this church now. While I have no intent nor desire to do anything to divide or question the authority of your representatives, are these fifty-six people assembled in the church here truly representative of all 900 Bikinians?

A(Henchi Balos): My opinion is that there are perhaps fifty heads of families qualified to speak for their families among the Bikinians. I don't know how many of those fifty family heads are here. A few women are here. I think there are enough here to speak but I would ask Tomaki Juda to respond also.

A(Tomaki Juda): I feel that the representation that is here, all of the Council being present, are those who are authorized to make community decisions. We also have other family heads and others sufficient to make decisions for the 900 Bikinians.

Statement : Jibas is a respected elderly gentleman and I support him and recognize (Henchi him as a spokesman. As representative of the entire Bikini community I must Balos) be in the middle and not support any one position, but I want both sides to be recognized and am in the middle. I think this would be a good time to have our legal counsel speak.

Comments(J. : It is difficult for me to speak on behalf of the Council. It is quite Weisgall) obvious that there are divergent views. However, based on my discussions with the Council, I'm certain that the Bikinians want an independent scientist to confirm DOE's assessments and only at that time can the Bikinians' decision be made. Assuming that the independent scientist would confirm DOE's assessments, then at least one-half of the population will want to return to Eneu. So we should proceed on the assumption that the independent scientist will confirm DOE's dose assessment and we should talk about resettlement on that basis.

atement(G. : From a personal perspective, I certainly have no intent to contest or
aw) dispute the will of the Council. However, the monumental decision you are
about to undertake is now being left to an individual we don't even know
and that doesn't help us decide today. You have twice rejected the scientist
proposed to you. I want to act now. Obviously, this is your decision, so
I must make two decisions: (1) If your scientist says the DOE report is
bad, then I must plan accordingly. (2) If your scientist says the DOE
report is OK, I plan accordingly, although I don't know what that will be.
My responsibility is to do something for you as soon as possible. In
closing, if it is your desire to take advantage of my time here, I am willing
to work with Senator Balos, Magistrate Tomaki, High Commissioner's Repre-
sentative Scott Stege, and Chief Secretary Oscar deBrum of the Marshalls
Government to discuss these problems.

tatement(J. : It has been difficult in the past working with the independent
eisgall) scientist concept, and the Bikinians haven't been certain what kind they
wanted. Two Americans were picked, but some felt they wanted a Japanese.
Meeting last night, there was an overwhelming vote to have an American
scientist review and assess survey results, so shortly I, Henchi, etc.,
will meet in Washington and review. If the scientist reviews and agrees and
recommends you can return, how many would want to go back?

(Gordon Law): If six weeks from now your independent scientist agrees that returning
is OK and Jibas asks "how many will go with me", how many wish to go? I,
myself, believe in my colleagues' information and assume your scientist
will agree as well. If so, how many will want to follow Jibas?

Q(Taro Lokobol): If we go back and we or our children are harmed in thirty years or
whenever, can we look to the United States to compensate us?

(Gordon Law): Okay. (Stege notes) Yes, you can look to us for aid. (Judy Knappe notes)

(Taro Lokobol): Could we have the signature of the U.S. President or a memorandum of
understanding?

(Gordon Law): A memorandum of understanding binds two parties. I believe if people
follow the restrictions set forth in the book I don't have to worry about
your children, and won't need to help.

Q: Please explain further what is meant by the memorandum binding two
parties. Are there rules for us to abide by?

A(Gordon Law): I would like them to follow rules, but I can't enforce that. There
is legislation that covers your children and future generations, known as
the Burton Bill.

Q(Tomaki Juda): I would like to ask DOE if it is true that when you monitor and take
blood from a person you pay them \$10.00 per person each time?

A(Roger Ray): Yes, in the past we have paid individuals for the inconvenience of
going from their home elsewhere to be examined, but that payment was not
for blood samples, it was for the inconvenience and food and taxis, etc.

Q(Tomaki Juda): If payment is not for samples, is there a value to the samples, and
could you consider paying for persons who give their life's blood?

(Roger Ray): While it could be considered, we haven't seen any reason before to do it. The program was developed to benefit people and we have not considered it necessary to pay for participation, which is on a voluntary basis. I see no justification to pay for participating if a person is on his home island.

(Tomaki Juda): If people return to Eneu and monitoring occurs (before no one had taken blood samples), the blood sampling is new and is a vital issue. We're giving something from our body. Can this be compensated?

(Roger Ray): We don't have any new program of taking blood. If taken it is for general health examinations. Radiological tests are done by whole body count and urine analysis. Blood, if taken, is for general health and for your benefit. It might be used to test for diabetes, etc. I see no reason for compensation, but if it is a concern of yours, we will relate it to the proper authorities.

(To Gordon Law): When can we leave?

(Gordon Law): When people make the decision they want to leave, it's my job to make that as soon as possible. To do it right, it has to be planned with the people's help and cooperation, and they need to tell us what they want.

(Older man): America brought us here. I cannot leave without America saying for us to move. I didn't ask to come here, I stay here where you put me until you tell me to move. I don't discredit the book. I feel it's accurate. Even if my atoll is contaminated, I'll go back if you tell me to go. I await your telling me. If you tell me to stay here for thirty years or one hundred years I will. You tell me. It's not satisfactory for you to tell me to tell you.

(Statement G. Law): An historical perspective of today's situation is important. This man was told to come here and was brought here to Kili. Agreement is made among people here that democratic government should prevail. It's not the same but not dissimilar to the United States. So recently you have decided to have representation in Washington, D.C. through legal counsel, in Majuro through your Senator, and in Saipan through the Trust Territory. You have decided that you're comfortable with representation. Democracy says the majority is to be served by representatives. I need representatives to tell me the number who wish to return, and I want to support your freedom to make that choice which is best for you. I don't want to rule you.

(Older man): I compare today's meeting to the meeting we had when we were asked to leave Bikini originally. We were told by a person representing a country of great power to leave so testing could be done. We were afraid we would die if we didn't leave. We were told we would be taken care of and watched over. We would be your children, and the U.S. would take responsibility. We went to Rongerik and were poisoned by fish. We then went to Kwajalein and were asked to choose, and didn't know what to choose. We ended up here on Kili and were told we would be here until Bikini was safe and we would be told to return. We were brought here to Kili. We are not happy here. We were shown other places (Wake for example). Nothing else looks good. You brought this book, I throw it down. Half of it's good, half is not. I don't understand it. How can you ask me to decide? We want you to say it's OK to return. It's too much responsibility for us to decide. We want the biggest U.S. bank to come here and be emptied. That's the only to make a help. The only thing that will help.

to follow certain restrictions. Through your democratic framework you must decide if you want to go, and how many will go. Historically money ruins societies, it does not do good.

statement : If we're not returned to Eneu, please don't put a helicopter pad here (Bikinian) (at Kili). If they don't follow me don't give them a helicopter.

(Bero Joel): We were assured help from the United States when we moved off of Bikini from Ejit) and went to Ejit. I can't put my finger on any help we have received.

(Gordon Law): What help have you specifically requested? I think of houses, food. I don't think you've been denied help, though perhaps some requests haven't reached us.

Statement(Bero : I've made my needs known, and haven't seen the results. Joel)

(Gordon Law): If you give me specific items and dates, I will check them out within 24 hours.

Comment(Bero : I thought we would get kerosene and matches and soap, and all we got Joel) were houses. (The following list was provided to Scott Stege by the people on Ejit, through Bero Joel:

- | | |
|--------------------|---|
| 1. Gas | 6. Power plant/electrical delivery system |
| 2. Kerosene | 7. Mattresses, sleeping mats |
| 3. Soap | 8. Copra cart |
| 4. School building | 9. Majuro/Ejitwalkie talkie system) |
| 5. Dispensary | |

statement(J. : In summary, it is clear that for several years and still today Bikini Weisgall) people are divided. Some want to go to Eneu today, and others want to stay on Kili regardless of safety. There are some who desire Eneu if the results of DOE are confirmed. Others want to stay on Ejit. We want to proceed on the following assumptions: (1) That some people want to return, and that it will be helpful to get actual numbers. These numbers may not be available until after the independent scientist evaluates DOE's assessments. (2) We need to look at anticipated master planning while Gordon Law is here. (3) We should also discuss what's involved in making permanent plans for Eneu and Kili as to timing.

At this point Gordon Law asked that we take a break and come back and talk about master planning. When the group returned, Gordon Law listed on large pieces of paper his concept of planning with the Bikinians.

terday and are in many cases old and not productive.

Statement(H. Balos) : In conclusion, it won't be too long before we will be able to make a decision based on the independent scientist's evaluation. Two additional items should be added to Gordon Law's list of facilities, and they are (1) airport renovation for Eneu and (2) Ejit dock repair.

The Dose Assessment Conference concluded with closing remarks by the principals Hal Hollister, Gordon Law, Tomaki Juda, Henchi Balos, Nathan Note (representing the Kili community), and Andrew Jakeo (representing the Ejit community).

The Micro Palm departed Kili following a difficult boarding from Kili's oceanside, at about 5:00 PM the evening of October 8 and reached Kwajalein October 9 at 9:00 PM.



Scott H. Stege